Finding Planets Around Nearby Stars & A Voice Within Research Collaborations

Courtney Dressing

Assistant Professor at UC Berkeley

Exoplanet Explorers March 19, 2021

Research funding provided by UC Berkeley, the David & Lucile Packard Foundation, the Sloan Foundation, the Hellman Family Faculty Fund, the NASA TESS Guest Investigator & K2 Guest Observer Programs, NASA FINESST Program, and NSF GRFP

Image Credit: NASA/JPL-Caltech

Big Question #1: How Common is Life?



Big Question #2: How can I maintain a scientific identity while working in a large collaboration?

Globular Cluster Messier 107 (Credit: ESA/NASA)

Collaborations During Graduate School

Research Group

- Advisor: David Charbonneau
- Grad cohort: Zach Berta-Thompson, Sarah Ballard, Elisabeth Newton, Jason Dittmann, Sukrit Ranjan
- Staff scientists: Jonathan Irwin
- Kepler Team
 - Attended team meetings
 - AO Imaging follow-up with Andrea Dupree (CfA)

HARPS-N Team

- Weekly in-person collaboration meetings at the CfA
- Monthly telecons with international collaborators

Collaborations As a Sagan Fellow

- Research Group
 - Met a few times/month with my research sponsor (Heather Knutson)
 - Attended weekly group meetings & chatted with students about their research
 - Worked with Heather to co-advise summer student Girish Duvvuri (now at CU)
- Caltech& NExSci/IPAC
 - Went to other departments/organizations on campus to attend talks
 - Joined K2 and Spitzer collaborations
 - Started working with new people! (e.g., Beichman, Christiansen, Ciardi, Crossfield, Schlieder)
- HARPS-N Team
 - Continued to call in to collaboration meetings
- LUVOIR Science & Technology Definition Team

Collaborations As a Faculty Member

- LUVOIR Science & Technology Definition Team
 - Attended several in person meetings
 - Participated in weekly telecons
 - Helped design LUVOIR & write the final report
- TESS-Keck Survey
 - Attending weekly telecons & less frequent all-hands meetings
 - Helped write & lead telescope proposals
 - Advising students working on papers
 - Co-leading various science cases
- Astro2020 Panel on Exoplanets, Astrobiology, & The Solar System
 - Read many white papers & summarized key findings
 - Attended several in-person meetings & many telecons
 - Helped write our panel report

Voting Members of LUVOIR

Science and Technology Definition Team



Debra Fischer Yale



Bradley Peterson Ohio State



Jacob Bean Chicago



Daniela Calzetti **UMass Amherst**



Penn State



Courtney Dressing Berkeley



Lee Feinberg NASA GSFC



Kevin France Colorado

Leonidas Moustakas

JPL



Olivier Guyon Arizona



John O'Meara St. Michael's



Jane Rigby NASA GSFC



Christopher Stark STScl

Rebekah Dawson



Walter Harris Arizona (LPL)



Ilaria Pascucci Arizona (LPL)



Aki Roberge NASA GSFC



Jason Tumlinson STScl



Mark Marley NASA Ames



Victoria Meadows Washington



Marc Postman STScl



David Schiminovich Columbia



Britney Schmidt

Georgia Tech





David Redding JPL





JPL

Non-Voting Members of LUVOIR

International Ex-Officio Non-Voting Members



Martin Barstow Leicester



Lars Buchhave Copenhagen



Nicolas Cowan McGill



José Dias do Nascimento Jr. Brazilian Federal University



Marc Ferrari Marseille



Ana Gomez de Castro Madrid



Kevin Heng Berne



Thomas Henning Max Planck



Michiel Min Netherlands Institute for Space Research



Antonella Nota ESA



akahiro Sum Osaka

Ex-Officio Non-Voting Members



Shawn Domagal-Goldman NASA GSFC



Mario Perez NASA HQ



Michael Garcia NASA HQ



Susan Neff NASA GSFC



Erin Smith NASA GSFC

LUVOIR Study Office at Goddard

Study Office



Giada Arney GSFC



Matt Bolcar GSFC



Knicole Colón GSFC



Julie Crooke GSFC



Tyler Groff

GSFC



Jason Hylan GSFC



Roser Juanola Parramon GSFC



n Ravi Kopparappu GSFC



Neil Zimmerman GSFC



ric Lopez GSFC



Avi Mandell GSFC



Geronimo Villanueva GSFC

My Research Group: Planets And Life in Space (PALs)

• Graduate Students

- Steven Giacalone (4th year)
- Andrew Mayo (3rd year)
- Emma Turtelboom (2nd year)
- Caleb Harada (1st year)
- Undergraduate Students
 - Roughly a dozen students who attend group meetings & work on team projects
 - Three students working on individual projects with me
 - Two students working on individual projects with Steven
- Group Structure
 - Weekly group meetings
 - Weekly one-on-one meetings
 - Slack channel
 - Team website
 - Shared Overleaf files for papers & proposals
 - Google drive for notes & presentations

Intermediate Questions & Talk Outline



What are the properties of those systems?

Which planets are rocky?

How frequent are Earth-like planets?

How common is life?

Q1. Where are the nearest planets?

Transit Observations Reveal Planet Sizes



Transit Observations Reveal Planet Sizes Radial Velocity Observations Reveal Planet Masses

Image credit: NASA/SDO, Scientific American

How detectable are these signals?





2285 Confirmed Planets 1792 Candidate Planets

The NASA *Kepler* Mission 2009 - 2013





George Ricker (P.I.)

Roland Vanderspek (Deputy P. I.) Massachusetts Institute of Technology

science center shared between MIT + Harvard/Smithsonian CfA

Ricker et al., JATIS, (2014)

Credit: Zach Berta-Thompson

Kepler Search Space: 3000 light-years 0.25% of the sky

TESS Search Space: 200 light-years All-sky

TESS's Sky Coverage



Southern Sky (Year 1)

Northern Sky (Year 2)

Image Credits: NASA/MIT/TESS and Ethan Kruse (USRA)

After the Extended Mission, TESS will have mapped even more of the sky



TESS has detected over 2000 Objects of Interest (TOIs)

NASA Exoplanet Archive



Plot & Data from NASA Exoplanet Archive

Most TOIs have short orbital periods

NASA Exoplanet Archive



Plot & Data from NASA Exoplanet Archive

Q2. What are the properties of nearby planets? *Planet characterization requires stellar characterization.*

Not All Candidate Signals will be Planets



Image Credit: NASA

Not All Candidate Signals will be Planets

Brown dwarf or low-mass star

Steven Giacalone (UCB 4th year grad) has built tools to vet TESS planet candidates

Blended stellar binaries

Grazing stellar binaries

Image Credit: NASA

Planet

Star

TRICERATOPS pipeline described in Giacalone, Dressing et al. 2021 AJ, 161, 24

12 Validated TOIs



Vetting of 384 TESS Objects of Interest with TRICERATOPS and Statistical Validation of 12 Planet Candidates

Steven Giacalone¹, Courtney D. Dressing¹, Eric L. N. Jensen², Karen A. Collins³, George R. Ricker⁴, Roland Vanderspek⁴, S. Seager^{4,5,6}, Joshua N. Winn⁷, Jon M. Jenkins⁸, Thomas Barclay^{9,10}, Khalid Barkaoui^{11,12}, Charles Cadieux¹³, David Charbonneau³, Kevin I. Collins¹⁴, Dennis M. Conti¹⁵, René Doyon¹³, Phil Evans¹⁶, Mourad Ghachoui¹², Michaël Gillon¹¹, Natalia M. Guerrero⁴, Rhodes Hart¹⁷, Emmanuël Jehin¹⁸, John F. Kielkopf¹⁹, Brian McLean²⁰, Felipe Murgas^{21,22}, Enric Palle^{23,24}, Hannu Parviainen^{23,24}, Francisco J. Pozuelos^{11,25}, Howard M. Relles³, Avi Shporer⁴, Quentin Socia^{26,31}, Chris Stockdale²⁷, Thiam-Guan Tan²⁸, Guillermo Torres³, Joseph D. Twicken^{8,29}, William C. Waalkes³⁰, and Ian A. Waite¹⁷

125 Likely Planets



Steven Giacalone (UCB 4th year grad)

52 Likely Nearby False Positives



Preferred Fit

TRICERATOPS fits multiple scenarios for each TOI to assess reliability



Giacalone, Dressing et al. 2021 AJ, 161, 24

TRICERATOPS fits multiple scenarios for each TOI to assess reliability

> Preferred Fit



Giacalone, Dressing et al. 2021 AJ, 161, 24

Thank you to TFOP!

Follow-up observations can help distinguish between TESS planets & false positives

No companion star detected. *Stronger* support for transiting planet?



Keck/TESS ToO Program (PI: Beichman)

Figure by D. Ciardi

Follow-up observations can help distinguish between TESS planets & false positives

Δδ [arcsec

Companion star detected. Weaker support for transiting planet?

THE ASTRONOMICAL JOURNAL, 157:51 (11pp), 2019 February © 2019. The American Astronomical Society. All rights reserved

HD 202772A b: A Transiting Hot Jupiter around a Bright, Mildly Evolved Star in a Visual Binary Discovered by TESS

Songhu Wang^{1,34}⁽⁰⁾, Matias Jones², Avi Shporer³⁽⁰⁾, Benjamin J. Fulton^{4,5}⁽⁰⁾, Leonardo A. Paredes⁶, Trifon Trifonov⁷⁽⁰⁾, Diana Kossakowski⁷, Jason Eastman⁸⁽⁶⁾, Seth Redfield⁹⁽⁶⁾, Maximilian N. Günther^{3,35}⁽⁶⁾, Laura Kreidberg^{8,10}⁽⁶⁾, Chelsea X. Huang^{3,35}, Sarah Millholland^{1,36}, Darryl Seligman¹, Debra Fischer¹, Rafael Brahm^{11,12,13}, Xian-Yu Wang^{14,15}, Bryndis Cruz¹, Todd Henry¹⁶, Hodari-Sadiki James⁶, Brett Addison¹⁷, En-Si Liang¹⁸, Allen B. Davis¹⁰, René Tronsgaard¹⁹, Keduse Worku¹, John M. Brewer¹, Martin Kürster⁷, Hui Zhang¹⁸, Charles A. Beichman⁵, Allyson Bieryla⁸, Timothy M. Brown^{20,21}, Jessie L. Christiansen⁵, David R. Ciardi⁵, Karen A. Collins⁸, Gilbert A. Esquerdo⁸, Andrew W. Howard⁴, Howard Isaacson²²⁽⁰⁾, David W. Latham⁸⁽⁰⁾, Tsevi Mazeh²³, Erik A. Petigura⁴, Samuel N. Quinn⁸⁽⁰⁾, Sahar Shahaf²³, Robert J. Siverd²⁴⁽⁰⁾, Florian Rodler²⁵, Sabine Reffert²⁶, Olga Zakhozhay⁷ George R. Ricker³, Roland Vanderspek³, Sara Seager^{3,28}, Joshua N. Winn²⁹, Jon M. Jenkins³⁰, Patricia T. Boyd³¹, Gábor Fűrész³, Christopher Henze³⁰, Alen M. Levine³, Robert Morris³², Martin Paegert⁸, Keivan G. Stassun^{24,33}, Eric B. Ting³⁰, Michael Vezie³, and Gregory Laughlin¹

Keck/TESS ToO Program (PI: Beichman)



Figure by D. Ciardi

Searching for Stellar Companions



Digression: The Importance of Follow-up Imaging for Studies of Planet Occurrence

Reliability: what fraction of candidates are actually planets?
Planet
Occurrence
Rate
Planets detected
Stars searched

Completeness: how many real planets were missed?

Stellar Companions Affect Reliability

- Some "planets" are actually diluted eclipsing binaries
- Real planets may be larger than estimated
- This effect is often considered



Stellar Companions Affect Reliability

- Some "planets" are actually diluted eclipsing binaries
- Real planets may be larger than estimated
- This effect is often considered

We are vetting TESS and K2 Objects of Interest by obtaining AO images with Lick/ShARCS, Keck/NIRC2, and Palomar/PHARO.

UCB Team: Arjun Savel (now at UMD), Steven Giacalone, Charles Fortenbach (SFSU), Andy Mayo, Caleb Harada, Emma Turtelboom, Jordan Fleming, Holden Gill

External Collaborators: Lea Hirsch, Jessie Christiansen, David Ciardi, Chas Beichman, Josh Schlieder, Erica Gonzales, Ian Crossfield

Stellar Companions Affect Completeness

- Stellar companions contribute light to the target aperture and reduce the sensitivity of transit searches
- This effect is typically ignored

We are refining estimates of the frequency of Earth-like planets by obtaining AO images of Kepler targets that would have been amenable to the detection of potentially habitable planets.

UCB Team: Arjun Savel (now at UMD), Steven Giacalone, Charles Fortenbach (SFSU), Andy Mayo, Caleb Harada, Emma Turtelboom, Jordan Fleming, Holden Gill

External Collaborators: Lea Hirsch, Jessie Christiansen, David Ciardi, Kevin Hardegree-Ullman, Jon Zink
Determining the Multiplicity of *Kepler* Target Stars to Revise Estimates of the Frequency of Earth-like Planets



Imaged 71 *Kepler* target stars with Lick/ShARCS





Arjun Savel (UCB 2020 graduate; now 1st year grad student at UMD)

Detected 14 companions within 4" of 13 stars

Q3. What are the compositions of these planets?

Our Solar System has Two Types of Planets









Planets 2-4x Larger than Earth are Common



Howard 2013, Science, 340, 572

Planets 2-4x Larger than Earth are Common



Howard 2013, Science, 340, 572

Few Small Planets Have Precise Density Estimates



Dorn et al. 2018

Few Small Planets Have Precise Density Estimates



Dorn et al. 2018



Credits: ESA, Alfred Vidal-Madjar, NASA

Kepler-538b: A Sub-Neptune with a Relatively Long Orbital Period



Andy Mayo (3rd yr UCB grad)



Mayo, Rajpaul, Buchhave, Dressing et al. 2019, AJ, 158, 165

Modeling the RVs of Kepler-538



Mayo, Rajpaul, Buchhave, Dressing et al. 2019, AJ, 158, 165



Andy Mayo (3rd yr UCB grad)

Kepler-538b Is Not Rocky



Andy Mayo (3rd yr UCB grad)



Mayo, Rajpaul, Buchhave, Dressing et al. 2019, AJ, 158, 165

A Precise Mass Estimate for the Young Sub-Neptune K2-136 c

Mayo, Dressing et al. (in prep)



Andy Mayo (3rd yr UCB grad)



Mann et al. 2018, AJ, 155, 4

Few Young Planets Have Precise Density Estimates



Mayo, Dressing et al. (in prep)

K2-136 c is Roughly Twice As Dense as Neptune



Mayo, Dressing et al. (in prep)

Q3b. Why is the mass-radius diagram so sparsely populated?

Most small planets detected by *Kepler* orbit stars that are too faint for current RV spectrographs



Data from the NASA Exoplanet Archive

Most small planets detected by *Kepler* orbit stars that are too faint for current RV spectrographs



Data from the NASA Exoplanet Archive

TESS planets are ideal targets for RV mass measurement



The TESS-Keck Survey (TKS)

A NASA-Keck Key Strategic Mission Support program & UC LMAP

California Institute of Technology • NASA • NASA Exoplanet Science Institute • UC Berkeley • UC Irvine • UC Riverside • UC Santa Cruz University of Hawaii • University of Kansas • W.M. Keck Observatory



We recognize and acknowledge the cultural role and reverence that the summit of Maunakea has within the indigenous Hawaiian community. We are deeply grateful to have the opportunity to conduct observations from this mountain.

The TESS-Keck Survey (TKS)

A NASA-Keck Key Strategic Mission Support program & UC LMAP

California Institute of Technology • NASA • NASA Exoplanet Science Institute • UC Berkeley • UC Irvine • UC Riverside • UC Santa Cruz University of Hawaii • University of Kansas • W.M. Keck Observatory



We recognize and acknowledge the cultural role and reverence that the summit of Maunakea has within the indigenous Hawaiian community. We are deeply grateful to have the opportunity to conduct observations from this mountain.

TOI-1246: 4 sub-Neptunes orbiting a K dwarf



Emma Turtelboom 2nd yr grad at UCB Lead Author



Lauren Weiss Parrent Fellow at UH

TOI-1246 was heavily observed by TESS



Turtelboom, Weiss, Dressing, TKS in prep

- 12 sectors of TESS photometry collected between July 2019 and April 2020
- 40 RVs collected between Nov 2019 and Oct 2020 using HIRES on Keck I

4 transiting sub-Neptunes



Turtelboom, Weiss, Dressing, TKS in prep

Planets b and e are near 2:1 resonance



PRELIMINARY

Planet masses range from 6 to 20 M_{\oplus}



Turtelboom, Weiss, Dressing, TKS in prep

TOI 1246 hosts 4 sub-Neptunes with diverse masses



Turtelboom, Weiss, Dressing, TKS in prep

TOI 1246 is one of only 8 fourplanet systems with both measured masses and radii for all four planets



Oceans?

Atmospheric circulation?

Stellar activity?

Atmospheric composition?

Obliquity?

Geological activity?

Magnetic fields?

Q4. How frequent are Earth-like planets?

Surface Temperature?

Rotation Rate?

Age?



Radius?

Mass?

Bulk composition?



Transit Spectroscopy

Meadows & Barnes (2018)

Secondary Eclipse

See planet thermal radiation disappear and reappear

Primary Eclipse

Measure size of planet See star's radiation transmitted through the planet atmosphere Learn about atmospheric circulation from thermal phase curves

Figure by S. Seager

The Hubble Space Telescope

The James Webb Space Telescope Will Provide a Closer Look at Planetary Atmospheres





Simulating JWST Observations of Potentially Habitable Planets Orbiting Nearby M Dwarfs

Number of Transits Needed for Detection

Host star	H_2O	CH ₄	CO ₂	O ₃
GJ 436	31	10	30	209
GJ 1132	14	4	13	142
TRAPPIST-1	12	3	10	172
GJ 1214	17	4	15	171
LHS 1140	25	5	21	354
GJ 3470	91	17	80	792
NLTT 41135	47	9	41	711
K2-18	93	18	80	824
LHS 6343	167	33	140	1332
Kepler-42	168	30	106	2880
K2-25	233	42	184	5887

Wunderlich et al. (2019)

The Exoplanet Community Has Developed a Plan to Optimize JWST Observations of Transiting Planets

Table 1: Approved GTO and ERS Transiting Planet Programs					
ID	Title and Science Instrument	Team Lead	Hours		
1177	MIRI observations of transiting exoplanets	T. Greene	7!		
1185	Transit Spectroscopy of Mature Planets (NIRCam)	T. Greene	140		
1201	NIRISS Exploration of the Atmospheric Diversity of Transiting Exoplanets	D. Lafrenière	20		
1224	Transiting Exoplanet Characterization with JWST/NIRSPEC	S. Birkmann	5		
1274	Extrasolar Planet Science with $JWST$ (NIRCam)	J. Lunine	7		
1279	Thermal emission from Trappist1-b (MIRI)	PO. Lagage	25		
1280	MIRI Transiting Observation of WASP-107b	PO. Lagage	1		
1281	MIRI and NIRSPEC Transit Observations of HAT-P-12 b	PO. Lagage	3		
1312	Transit and Eclipse Spectroscopy of a Warm Neptune (NIRISS+NS+MIRI)	N. Lewis	3		
1331	Transit Spectroscopy of TRAPPIST-1e (NIRSpec)	N. Lewis	2		
1353	Transit and Eclipse Spectroscopy of a Hot Jupiter (NIRISS+NS+MIRI)	N. Lewis	75		
1366	The Transiting Exoplanet Community ERS Program (all SIs)	N. Batalha	73		
	TOTAL		81		

Characterizing Transiting Exoplanets with JWST Guaranteed Time and ERS Observations (Greene et al. 2019)



Engaging Citizen Scientists to Keep Transit Times Fresh and Ensure the Efficient Use of Transiting Exoplanet Characterization Missions (Zellem et al. 2019)

A FRAMEWORK FOR OPTIMIZING EXOPLANET TARGET SELECTION FOR THE JAMES WEBB SPACE TELESCOPE

CHARLES D. FORTENBACH¹ AND COURTNEY D. DRESSING²





Charles Fortenbach (SFSU MA Student)


Prioritizing *TESS* Planets for Atmospheric Characterization with *JWST*





C. Fortenbach

See also Kempton et al. (2018), Louie et al. (2018), Batalha et al. (2018)

Prioritizing *TESS* Planets for Atmospheric Characterization with *JWST*



See also Kempton et al. (2018), Louie et al. (2018), Batalha et al. (2018)

Fortenbach & Dressing 2020, PASP,132, 054501



Q5. How Common is Life?



LYNX X-RAY OBSERVATOR

NASA

CONCEPT STUDY REPORT

LUVOIR IS . . .



A community-driven, UV/O/IR observatory able to perform direct spectroscopy of dozens of exoEarth candidates, high-fidelity Solar System remote sensing, and transformative astrophysics

LUVOIR-A

15-m, on-axis telescope 120 segments, 1.2 to-flat 155 m² collecting Four instrument ba ECLIPS LUMOS HDI POLLUX



LUVOIR-B

8-m, off-axis telescop 55 segments, 0.955-m 43.4 m² collecting are Three instrument bays ECLIPS LUMOS HDI





EXOTIC WORLDS

THE SEARCH FOR LIFE

OUR DYNAMIC Solar System

COSMIC ORIGINS & THE ULTRA-FAINT UNIVERSE



EXOTIC WORLDS

THE SEARCH FOR LIFE

AMBITIOUS GOAL DRIVES TELESCOPE SIZE



THE HABITABLE PLANET SURVEY OBSERVATIONS





Colors, orbits, & partial spectra for all habitable planet candidates

Simulated high-contrast image of the Solar System at 12.5 pc with ECLIPS on LUVOIR-A



Searching for Signs of Life



DOZENS OF HABITABLE CANDIDATES, HUNDREDS OF PLANETS





LUVOIR WILL OBSERVE A WIDE RANGE OF PLANETS





TRANSMISSION SPECTRA WITH LUVOIR



OUR DYNAMIC Solar System



Flyby-quality observations of Solar System bodies

Jupiter from JUNO at ~ 30 km resolution Comparable to LUVOIR-A (~ 24 km at opposition)

COSMIC ORIGINS & THE ULTRA-FAINT UNIVERSE



SEEKING THE BUILDING BLOCKS OF GALAXIES

Exposure Time:

100 seconds



LUVOIR-A (15 meter) F850LP (z-band), 5sig lim = 28.00 mag



LUVOIR's **Deep Fields** – many collected in parallel with deep exoplanets observations - will reach will reach down to the very smallest mass scale galaxy formation



HD



Research funding provided by UC Berkeley, the David & Lucile Packard Foundation, the Sloan Foundation, the Hellman Family Faculty Fund, the NASA TESS Guest Investigator & K2 Guest Observer Programs, NASA FINESST Program, and NSF GRFP

Summary

Kepler revealed that small & cool planets are common TESS is finding small planets orbiting nearby stars Ground-based facilities are characterizing planetary systems JWST will probe planetary atmospheres Future instruments will search for habitable & inhabited worlds

Estimating Planet Reliability



Giacalone et al. (2021)

Validating Planets



Exploring Planet Composition



Turtelboom et al. (in prep)

Advice for Working in Collaborations

- Communicate regularly and clearly with your team.
 - Delineate tasks & roles for team members.
 - Hold meetings with pre-determined agendas.
 - Maintain a shared repository of information.
 - Establish useful communication channels (e.g., email lists, Slack workspaces).

• Share your interests with your collaborators.

- Explain what you want to focus on and why.
- Convince others that your goals are exciting!
- Learn about work by your team members.
- Seek out opportunities for collaboration.
- Speak up for yourself if necessary.
 - Clarify ambiguous messages.
 - Have awkward conversations about publication plans.
 - Pay attention to group dynamics.
 - Ensure that all group members are treated with respect.
- Routinely re-assess your interest in the collaboration.
 - Check your "time budget."
 - Verify that you're still working on topics that you find exciting.
 - Ensure that the collaboration behaves ethically and fairly.

ADDITIONAL SLIDES